

CITY OF ARMADALE

MINUTES

OF TECHNICAL SERVICES COMMITTEE HELD IN THE FUNCTION ROOM,
ADMINISTRATION CENTRE, 7 ORCHARD AVENUE, ARMADALE ON MONDAY, 1
MAY 2023 AT 7.00PM.

PRESENT:

Cr E J Flynn (Deputy Chair)
Cr R Butterfield
Cr M S Northcott
Cr S Peter JP
Cr G J Smith
Cr S S Virk
Cr S J Mosey (Deputy to Cr G Nixon)

APOLOGIES:

Cr G Nixon (Chair) (Leave of Absence)

OBSERVERS:

Cr J Keogh
Cr P Hetherington (*Via Teams*)
Cr G Nixon (*Via Teams, 7.05pm to 08.16pm*)
Cr M Silver (*Via Teams*)

IN ATTENDANCE:

Ms J Abbiss	Chief Executive Officer
Mr M Andrews	Executive Director Technical Services
Mr J Lyon	Executive Director Corporate Services (<i>Via Teams</i>)
Ms S van Aswegen	Executive Director Community Services (<i>Via Teams</i>)
Mr G Stewart	Project Manager Technical Services
Mr N Burbridge	Head of Environment & Sustainability Technical Services
Mr S Morrow	Manager Operational Excellence Technical Services
Ms N Mathieson	Senior Administration Assistant Technical Services

PUBLIC:

Nil

*“For details of Councillor Membership on this Committee, please refer to the City’s website
– [www.armadale.wa.gov.au/your council/councillors](http://www.armadale.wa.gov.au/your_council/councillors).”*

DISCLAIMER

The Disclaimer for protecting Councillors and staff from liability of information and advice given at Committee meetings was not read as there were no members of the public present.

DECLARATION OF MEMBERS' INTERESTS

Nil

QUESTION TIME

Nil

DEPUTATION

Nil

CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES

RECOMMEND

Minutes of the Technical Services Committee Meeting held on 3 April 2023 be confirmed.

Moved Cr M S Northcott

MOTION CARRIED

(7/0)

ITEMS REFERRED FROM INFORMATION BULLETIN

Outstanding Matters and Information Items

Various Items

Committee noted the information and no further items were raised for discussion and / or further report purposes.

.

CONTENTS

TECHNICAL SERVICES COMMITTEE

1 MAY 2023

1.	ENGINEERING DESIGN AND DEVELOPMENT	
1.1	URBAN FOREST	4
2.	WASTE SERVICES	
2.1	STOPPING COMERCIAL ASBESTOS LOADS TO LANDFILL	12
3.	TENDERS	
3.1	TENDER 26 OF 2022 - CARRADINE ROAD / NEERIGEN BROOK CULVERT DESIGN AND RECONSTRUCTION.....	15
3.2	RFQ/34/22 - TREE MAINTENANCE SERVICE.....	19
4.	MISCELLANEOUS	
4.1	STOP SIGNS - CORNER OF WOLLASTON AVENUE, HAYNES AND ELEVENTH ROAD, HILBERT (COUNCILLOR REFERRAL ITEM).....	24
4.2	WASTE STRATEGY AND FOGO.....	26
5.	COUNCILLORS' ITEMS	
	NIL	27
6.	EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TECHNICAL SERVICES REPORT	
	NIL	27

1.1 - URBAN FOREST

WARD : ALL

FILE No. : M/137/23

DATE : 13 March 2023

REF : JA/DH

RESPONSIBLE : Executive Director
MANAGER : Technical Services

In Brief:

- Council considered a report on the Urban Forest Strategy at its meeting on 8 March 2023 which summarised a number of potential sub-strategies and actions
- Following consideration of the report item, Council resolved to receive a further report on the establishment of a tree asset database including a cost estimate. (T4/3/23 refers)
- This report recommends that Council allocate additional funding for the progression of the Asset Tree Mapping outlined, which is a cornerstone activity in support of the Urban Forest Strategy

Tabled Items

Nil

Decision Type

- ☐ **Legislative** The decision relates to general local government legislative functions such as adopting/changing local laws, town planning schemes, rates exemptions, City policies and delegations etc.
- ☒ **Executive** The decision relates to the direction setting and oversight role of Council.
- ☐ **Quasi-judicial** The decision directly affects a person's rights or interests and requires Councillors at the time of making the decision to adhere to the principles of natural justice.

Officer Interest Declaration

Nil

Strategic Implications

The subject of this report has impact on the following objectives of the Strategic Community Plan 2020-2030:

- 1.1.2 Cultivate the sense of place generated by the City's heritage, vegetation and escarpment, wetlands and waterways as well as the participation in vibrant community hubs.
- 1.1.4 Preserve and celebrate the City's built, natural and cultural heritage.
- 1.2 Improve Community Wellbeing
- 2.2 Attractive, inclusive and functional public places
 - 2.2.1 Focus on achieving a high level of streetscape amenity in new developments.
 - 2.2.2 Improve the amenity of streetscapes in established suburbs to provide an attractive, shaded network that connects residents to locations of interest.
 - 2.3.2 Ensure that the City's Asset Management Strategy contributes to the provision of functional and affordable infrastructure that is sustainable for current and future generations.
 - 2.3.3 Assets are to be effectively maintained in order to meet service levels throughout their life cycle
 - 2.3.5 The City maintains its operational infrastructure in the most cost effective manner to sustain service delivery.
 - 2.5.2 Seek the retention of trees in new subdivisions and developments.

Legal Implications

General assessment of relevant legislation (eg *Local Government Act 1995*) has not revealed any restrictions.

Council Policy/Local Law Implications

Assessment of Policy/Local Law indicates that the following are applicable:

- ENG 6 – Street trees
- Urban Forest Strategy

Budget/Financial Implications

Implementing the recommendations detailed within this report will require the allocation of additional funds to these projects in Council's FY24 Budget and Long Term Financial Plan. Refer within.

Consultation

- Intra Directorate

BACKGROUND

At the Ordinary Council Meeting of 13 March 2023, the Urban Forest Implementation Program Progress Report was presented (T4/3/23 refers). Following consideration of the report item, Council resolved to:

1. *Receive the City of Armadale Urban Forest Implementation Program Progress Report and support the recommendations noted within.*
2. *Consider at future budget deliberations support of funding for a tree asset data base.*
3. *Consider at future budget deliberations support of funding for consultancy to undertake the strategy renewal.*
4. *Provide a report at the next Technical Services Committee meeting for the establishment of a tree asset database including a cost estimate.*

This report addresses point 4, details and costings to undertake the establishment of a tree asset database.

DETAILS OF PROPOSAL

The City seeks to better understand, grow and maintain its Urban Forest. In order to do this more effectively, a baseline data set of the existing trees needs to be established. The long term social and economic benefits in establishing and maintaining a tree data set have been widely recognised including:

Data Collection, Analysis and Planning

- Ability to analyse existing species and improve diversity through informed species selection.
- Identify pockets of vegetation that may be at increased risk of pest and disease attack via lack of diversity.
- Identify potential opportunities to establish and improve habitat links between rural and urban areas.
- Prioritise and target planting areas in conjunction with thermal mapping.
- Ability to analyse successes and failures to improve decision making.
- Tangible data to set canopy targets and track progress.
- Recognise and protect existing extraordinary examples of green assets for future generations.

Maintenance

- Ability to establish targeted maintenance schedules for green assets including pruning, pest and disease management, watering, and fertilising.
- Reduce loss of green assets via inconsistent management.
- More accurate budget estimates for ongoing maintenance.
- Tangible data to assert additional resourcing requirements.
- More accurate end of life and condition assessments to reduce reactive works through improved programmed maintenance schedules.

This report explores what tree information is crucial and desirable to be collected and the potential from this investment.

ANALYSIS

Data Collection

The extent, associated costs and consequential value of an urban tree database is variable, with the potential complexity of data required corresponding with how the data is intended on being utilised.

For the City, the immediate aim would be to undertake a basic capture of trees across the City situated within residential verges, parks, road reserves and City managed properties. The initial capture would exclude bushland and nature reserves as canopy can be effectively monitored via remote/satellite imagery.

To collect the raw data, an arborist consultant would be required as a minimum to visit and assess each and every street tree. The tree would be assigned a unique identifier (asset number) and GIS mapped. The following is recommended to be captured for each tree as follows:

- Photograph
- Family, Genus, and species
- Expected proportions at maturity
- Approx. Age
- Diameter at Breast Height
- Height
- Width of canopy at widest point
- Health/ Defects Observations
- Significant Value – TPO worthy? Habitat Trees? Indigenous significance?
- Helliwell value – information to calculate value must be collected on the ground and a cost-effective opportunity would be missed if not part of this data collection. This significant information clearly demonstrates the importance of the green asset in monetary terms. It keeps the worth of the asset front of mind enabling rational decision making around maintenance, removal / retention and for funding required including that for the replacement standards that will apply though the refreshed UFS.

It is officer's recommendation that the above data is collected and recorded for each street tree as a minimum standard.

Additional data capture such as mapping of vacant planting locations should also be considered. Identifying such sites and assigning an asset number allows officers to quickly identify potential sites for future planting seasons, allows officers to update planting information between audits and can be used as a tool to estimate future canopy

To capture the bulk of the Urban Forrest it is estimated that approximately 50,000 trees would need assessment excluding heavily forested suburbs such as Ashendon, Bedfordale, Karragullen and Roleystone.

Early discussions with consultants have estimated that \$15 per tree would be required for the initial data collection. In addition IT support throughout the process will be required to transfer data received into the Intramaps system and OneCouncil. Based on an estimated 50,000 trees, \$750k would be required for tree collection data. In addition there is a significant volume of work to establish the configuration system, undertake the initial data migration and train staff on its use. Internal estimates suggest up to an additional \$250,000 for the IT support data transfer may be required.

Collecting individual tree data in the numbers required is a significant undertaking. This could be undertaken in a phased manner over a number of years or targeted for completion as quickly as possible, depending on consultant availability and the competing budget priorities of Council. There is an advantage to undertaking the full scope, as this offers the truest measure of the health and needs of the urban forest. Full scope would include capturing all recommended data fields as outlined previously for the bulk of the Urban Forrest excluding those areas that are heavily forested such as Ashendon, Bedfordale, Karragullen and Roleystone. When looking to inform the Strategy review and day-to-day management, a full inventory is best.

However, if the funds and resources are not available for a full inventory immediately, a phased approach could be undertaken. Data fields such as Helliwell value could be captured in subsequent audits, only for established trees or on a case by case bases as the need arises. Eliminating data fields reduces the time taken to capture each tree's data and therefore reduces cost.

A phased inventory could be completed over several years as funds allow. Over time the comprehensive coverage is collected but the financial and resource burden is distributed over a longer period of time.

Alternatively a partial inventory could focus on one specific area of concern, like all street and parkland trees in an identified district.

Although benefit will be gained from collecting data in any area, with a phased approach there are different priorities from a planning and maintenance perspective. The planning phase of the urban forest would prioritise newer areas of unknowns or little notable vegetation as these would be likely targets for planting programs. From a maintenance perspective, established areas with significant vegetation would be targeted as this is where the bulk of maintenance costs originate. After considering the priorities of both business areas a balanced approach is recommended to spread the benefit of usable data if a phased approach is applied.

Data Maintenance

Once the initial information is collected and installed within the database, this provides a snapshot of our urban forest at that period of time. Trees are always changing and tree data loses value over time if it is not updated. To continue to get the most from this initial investment it will be important to ensure data is regularly input into OneCouncil with an

Enterprise Asset Management (EAM) system as part of the pre-configured tree register. City officers will have access to the Work Management System module within OneCouncil which will allow them to create a work order against tree assets. This work order will capture all the maintenance tasks and costs performed at a single point in time against a specific tree asset. This will extend the life of the initial data collection as a powerful urban forest management tool.

There is also opportunity to introduce the requirement for developers to supply tree data that can also be fed into OneCouncil. This will capture developer tree planting ensuring adequate contribution in new subdivisions.

However a regular audit should be still budgeted for initially. It is recommended an audit undertaken every 8-10 years to ensure the data is up to date, allowing green assets time to grow and to the record traceable differences.

Tree Maintenance

The data already captured will be migrated in to EAM's tree register inclusive of all relevant attribute information and spatial locations.

Future data will be captured by the most efficient methodology as determined by the awarded contractor. The data received will be audited and migrated into EAM's tree register.

Once the data is available in EAM's tree register officer can now access the assets for the purpose of work management

What this means:

- Maintenance schedules can be created against tree assets to routinely create work orders so planned preventative works can be completed and levels of service maintained.
- The City will have a greater understanding of what planned preventative works are scheduled annually and over multiple years. This allows for forecasting of cost and resources appropriate to the purposed level of service.
- Can be used to capture assets lost via weather events, help justification for succession planting programs
- Capture of cost of all resources associated to maintain a tree asset across customer requests, planned corrective and planned preventative works performed. This will allow the City to analyse the cost associated with maintaining tree assets at an individual level or by any defined locality
- Council and the community will have transparency on the magnitude, nature and type of the tree asset portfolio inclusive of the cost to maintain based on an agreed level of service and the associated unplanned reactive costs annually or over multiple years.

Offsetting of Funding – Option 3

At the Technical Services Committee meeting in March, it was inquired if a cost saving could be formulated from the current urban forest planting program budget (\$500k) to fund data collection costs. If we consider the City's current 'tree investments' in isolation, there seems to be only one lever to offset the cost burden of this core initiative. This would be via the temporary reduction of planting new trees within the Urban Forest Planting program from years 24/25 to 26/27.

The trees for 2023/2024 have already been ordered and will be installed this winter. Maintenance and watering for recently planted trees will need to continue for three years. In addition, resident request tree planting has been retained in the below calculations, at an estimated 150 trees per year.

The table below is presented as an opportunity to reallocate funding to tree data collection from the Urban Forest budget.

As examples and to assist with understanding of the table:

- The column referred to as “Tree Watering” illustrates the reduction of spend over the three-year period on external service providers, as we reduce the number of trees being planted and therefore the amount requiring watering. Note, this would return to historical levels and the full budgeted amount of spend, once this data collection activity is concluded (FY 27/28).
- The items referred to as “Staff” below, relates to our internal team members’ time (and associated budget including vehicle costs) which is proposed to be reallocated to ‘other maintenance’ work currently performed by external service providers. This offset, is due to our team members being diverted on to tasks currently being delivered by one of the City’s contractors (passive open-space maintenance activities).

In doing this, we could create the budget headroom and capacity for the reinvestment into the City’s Urban Forest (data capture).

Urban Forest Planting Program Budget Items					
Budget	Greenstock & Materials	Tree Watering	Staff	Promotions and Community Engagement	Total
Budget 23/24	\$ 65,000.00	\$125,000.00	\$295,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$ 500,000.00
saving reallocation	-	-	-	-	\$ -
Budget 24/25	\$ 65,000.00	\$ 125,000.00	\$295,000.00	\$ 15,000.00	
saving reallocation	\$ 46,250.00	\$ 84,097.60	\$ 165,898.00	-	\$ 296,245.60
Budget 25/26	\$ 65,000.00	\$ 125,000.00	\$295,000.00	\$ 15,000.00	
saving reallocation	\$ 46,250.00	\$ 114,528.00	\$204,317.00	-	\$ 365,095.00
Budget 26/27	\$ 65,000.00	\$ 125,000.00	\$ 295,000.00	\$ 15,000.00	
saving reallocation	\$ 46,250.00	\$125,000.00	\$ 246,658.00	-	\$417,908.00
Total saving over 3 years					\$ 1,079,248.60

Based on the reduction of tree planting and assuming Council continued its current yearly budget of \$500,000, it is estimated \$1.07M could be saved by 26/27 to afford the data collection. However, this would mean less trees planted within this time and a commitment to a phased data collection approach.

OPTIONS

The following options are presented for consideration:

1. Provide \$1,000,000 additional funding to establish baseline tree data within the quickest timeframe possible
2. Provide additional funding to establish baseline tree data over a period of 4 years (\$250,000 per year)

3. Reduce planting program as of 2024/25 to supplement tree data collection and establish baseline tree data over a period of 3 years
4. Decide not to establish baseline tree data, continue to operate as is.

It is officer's recommendation that Option 1 is supported.

CONCLUSION

The benefits of a healthy Urban Forest are well documented and include a range of benefits. In order to manage the Urban Forest more effectively, it is recommended that a tree asset database is developed. It is therefore recommended that Council note the outcomes of the investigation into the requirements of a tree asset database for consideration during the FY24 budget deliberations.



ATTACHMENTS

There are no attachments for this report.

Committee Discussion

It was suggested that Technical Services Officers seek opportunities to potentially source assistance from university students and the likes in support of the data collection process.

RECOMMEND

T1/5/23

That Council:

1. Note the contents of this report
2. Give consideration to the allocation of additional funding to an amount of \$1,000,000 for the establishment of a tree asset database during the FY24 budget deliberations.

Moved Cr S J Mosey
MOTION CARRIED

(7/0)

2.1 - STOPPING COMERCIAL ASBESTOS LOADS TO LANDFILL

WARD : ALL
FILE No. : M/189/23
DATE : 12 April 2023
REF : SW/NM
RESPONSIBLE : Executive Director
MANAGER : Technical Services

In Brief:

- Cessation of acceptance of commercial loads (greater than 5kg) of asbestos at the Armadale Landfill and Recycling Facility from 1 July 2023.
- Continue to accept up to 5kg correctly wrapped and labelled asbestos from City of Armadale residents/residential properties.
- Recommend that Council endorse this proposal based on the identified risk and limited space available.

Tabled Items

Nil

Decision Type

- ☐ **Legislative** The decision relates to general local government legislative functions such as adopting/changing local laws, town planning schemes, rates exemptions, City policies and delegations etc.
- ☒ **Executive** The decision relates to the direction setting and oversight role of Council.
- ☐ **Quasi-judicial** The decision directly affects a person's rights or interests and requires Councillors at the time of making the decision to adhere to the principles of natural justice.

Officer Interest Declaration

Nil

Strategic Implications

Nil

Legal Implications

Nil

Council Policy/Local Law Implications

Nil

Budget/Financial Implications

In the 2021/2022 financial year the City received 180 tonnes of asbestos charged at \$243 per tonne with a minimum charge of \$91 (totaling \$22,113). Current fees are set at \$252.50 per tonne with a minimum charge of \$94.

Consultation

1. Internal consultation with operational staff at the Armadale Landfill and Recycling Facility and Supervisors.
2. Consultant input on fill requirements.
3. Agreed direction from management staff within Waste Services.
4. Information provided to community compliance staff within the City of Armadale, that is Rangers, Building, Health and Planning Compliance.
5. Executive Manager Corporate Services
6. Health, Safety and Wellbeing Lead
7. Environment Coordinator

BACKGROUND

The acceptance of asbestos at waste management facilities is regulated under strict conditions. The Armadale Landfill and Recycling Facility (ALARF) is licenced to accept asbestos under L6964/1997/11. As part of the Strategic Waste Management Plan, the 'time to zero' capacity at ALARF is a key component. As planned, ALARF's capacity is reducing, which limits operational flexibility, including the landfilling of large quantities of asbestos in accordance with the licence conditions. The team predicts that ALARF will no longer be able to accept commercial loads of asbestos from 1 July 2023 due to the current rate of filling and due to ALARF progressing towards its final levels in the area designated for asbestos disposal. The asbestos pit will subsequently be covered with a minimum of two metres of waste in advance of final capping, which is planned for 2025. For clarity, the 'asbestos area' receives daily cover as part of the City's licence conditions.

DETAILS OF PROPOSAL

It is proposed that the ALARF no longer accepts commercial loads of asbestos for disposal onsite but continue to accept up to 5kg of correctly wrapped and labelled asbestos from residences in the City of Armadale.

The City will prepare and disseminate communications alerting the community, surrounding local governments and commercial asbestos contractors of the changes.

It is anticipated that contractors would utilise one of the following sites:

- Millar Road Landfill Facility
- Henderson Waste Recovery Park
- Red Hill Waste Management Facility

ANALYSIS

Asbestos is a high risk waste type and its disposal is highly regulated. The fee charged for disposal of asbestos is high due to the handling costs involved for disposal. The revenue lost from asbestos disposal is not significant and is accounted for.

OPTIONS

The City can no longer accept large quantities of asbestos at the ALARF for burial at the site as operations manage the site towards the conversion from a landfill to a transfer station.

Ceasing acceptance of commercial loads will allow for small amounts (up to 5kg) to be accepted from residential properties within the City.

CONCLUSION

Due to the limitation of suitable space and the highly regulated setting for asbestos acceptance and burial it is not feasible to continue to accept commercial loads as of 1 July 2023.

ATTACHMENTS

There are no attachments for this report.

RECOMMEND

T2/5/23

That Council:

1. **Cease acceptance of commercial loads of asbestos (>5kg) to be disposed at Armadale Landfill and Recycling Facility from 1 July 2023.**
2. **Remove the fee from the City's Fees and Charges Schedule for disposal of commercial loads of asbestos from 1 July 2023.**
3. **Continue to accept up to 5kg of correctly wrapped and labelled asbestos from City of Armadale residences in the 2023/24 financial year until such a time it is no longer feasible to do so.**
4. **Maintain a fee for the disposal of small amounts (up to 5kg) of asbestos in the City's FY24 Fees and Charges Schedule.**
5. **Communicate the changes to the community, surrounding local governments and commercial asbestos contractors.**

Moved Cr R Butterfield
MOTION CARRIED

(7/0)

**3.1 - TENDER 26 OF 2022 - CARRADINE ROAD / NEERIGEN BROOK CULVERT
DESIGN AND RECONSTRUCTION**

WARD : HILLS

FILE No. :

DATE : 27 March 2023

REF : AJ

RESPONSIBLE Executive Director
MANAGER Technical Services

In Brief:

- Tender 26 of 2022 was recently advertised for Carradine Road/Neerigen Brook Culvert Design for Reconstruction.
- Two (2) compliant tenders were received by the specified closing time and evaluated against compliance and qualitative criteria.
- The Report recommends that the Council in regards to Tender 26/22 for Carradine Road/Neerigen Brook Culvert Design for Reconstruction adopt the recommendation detailed within Confidential Attachment 2.

Tabled Items

Nil.

Decision Type

- ☐ **Legislative** The decision relates to general local government legislative functions such as adopting/changing local laws, town planning schemes, rates exemptions, City policies and delegations etc.
- ☒ **Executive** The decision relates to the direction setting and oversight role of Council.
- ☐ **Quasi-judicial** The decision directly affects a person's rights or interests and requires Councillors at the time of making the decision to adhere to the principles of natural justice.

Officer Interest Declaration

Nil.

Strategic Implications

- 2.3.3 Assets are to be effectively maintained in order to meet service levels throughout their life cycle;
- 2.3.5 The City maintains its operational infrastructure to the most cost effective manner to sustain service delivery;
- 4.1.2 Develop and maintain a comprehensive suite of strategies and plans to guide the City's delivery of infrastructure and services to the community.

Legal Implications

Assessment of legislation indicates that the following apply:

- Section 3.57 *Local Government Act 1995* – Tenders for providing goods or services
- Division 2 *Local Government (Functions and General) Regulations 1996* – Tenders for providing goods or services

Council Policy/Local Law Implications

Assessment of Policy/Local Law indicates that the following are applicable:

- Council Policy ADM 19 – Procurement of Goods or Services

Budget/Financial Implications

The budget and financial implications of adopting the recommendation are detailed within Confidential Attachment 2.

Consultation

- Intra Directorate

BACKGROUND

Tender 26 of 2022 for Carradine Road/Neerigen Brook Culvert Design for Reconstruction was advertised in the 3 December 2022 edition of the West Australian newspaper, the City's e-Tendering portal Vendor Panel and in a notice which was displayed on the Administration Centre, Armadale, Kelmscott and Seville Grove Libraries' public notice boards.

Tender 26 of 2022 closed at 2:00pm on 30 January 2023. Procurement staff were present at the tender close and all applicable details were captured in the tender register immediately as per Regulation 16(3) of the *Local Government (Functions and General) Regulations 1996*.

DETAILS OF PROPOSAL

The Scope of works requires a Contractor to remove the existing concrete pipes and outlet structures, reconstruction of a section of Carradine Road, installation of a new box culvert structure and cast in-situ end treatments and various related road construction elements.

The proposed works are located on Carradine Road, approximately 100m from the intersection with Albany Highway in the City of Armadale Local Government area. The existing drainage structure requires replacement to allow for better dry serviceability of the local community including during flood events.

A detailed specification for the quotation was prepared in conjunction with WML Consultants and the Program Delivery team.

Council approval is sought to award the tender for Tender 26 of 2022 for Carradine Road/Neerigen Brook Culvert Design for Reconstruction to be completed on supply of the requirements with a twelve (12) month defects liability period.

COMMENT

Analysis

Tenders were received from:

	Tenderer's OR Respondent's Name
1.	Civcon Civil & Project Management Pty Ltd
2.	DCL Formwork Pty Ltd
3.	Egan Civil Pty Ltd
4.	Neo Civil Pty Ltd

No submissions were received after the close of deadline.

Two (2) non-conforming tenders were received and were not assessed on the basis they did not satisfactorily meet the compliance criteria, namely they did not meet the value for money requirements.

An evaluation of the two compliant tenders was undertaken having specific regard to the Qualitative Criteria:

Criteria	Weighting
Previous Experience	35%
Ability to Commence	25%
Methodology	30%
Sustainability	10%

Upon completion of the evaluation, final scores and pricing were entered into the Evaluation Matrix as shown in the Confidential Attachment, where a final analysis took place to determine the most suitable Tenderer.

CONCLUSION

Tenders for Carradine Road/Neerigen Brook Culvert Design for Reconstruction were recently invited with two (2) tenders being received and assessed by an evaluation panel against compliance and qualitative criteria.

The tender submitted by DCL Formwork Pty Ltd is considered to be the tender which represents the best value for money outcome by the City. The Evaluation Panel therefore recommends that the tender submitted by DCL Formwork Pty Ltd be accepted for the lump sum of \$1,544,481.04 (exc GST).

MEETING CLOSED TO PUBLIC

MOVED Cr Northcott that the meeting be closed to members of the public as the matter to be discussed, if disclosed, would reveal information that has a commercial value to a person. (*Section 5.23(2) (e iii) of the Local Government Act*)

Motion Carried (7/0)

Meeting declared closed at 7.32pm

Committee discussed the Confidential Evaluation Report and Pricing Schedule and agreed to accept the tender from DCL Formwork Pty Ltd in accordance with:

- The tenderer's Price Schedule as presented; and*
- The ~~Council's~~ City's contract documentation, Budget and Long Term Financial Plan estimates*

ATTACHMENTS

1. Confidential Attachment 1 - Pricing Schedule - Tender 26 of 2022 - Carradine Road Neerigen Brook Culvert Design for Reconstruction - *This matter is considered to be confidential under Section 5.23(2) (e iii) of the Local Government Act, as the matter, if disclosed, would reveal information about the business, professional, commercial or financial affairs of a person*
2. Confidential Attachment 2 - Evaluation Report - Tender 26 of 2022 - Carradine Road Neerigen Brook Culvert Design for Reconstruction - *This matter is considered to be confidential under Section 5.23(2) (e iii) of the Local Government Act, as the matter, if disclosed, would reveal information about the business, professional, commercial or financial affairs of a person*

RECOMMEND

T3/5/23

That Council, in regard to Tender 26/22 for Carradine Road / Neerigen Brook Culvert Design for Reconstruction, adopt the recommendation to accept the tender submitted by DCL Formwork Pty Ltd for the lump sum of \$1,544,481.04 (exc GST).

**Moved Cr R Butterfield
MOTION CARRIED**

(7/0)

MEETING OPENED TO PUBLIC

MOVED Cr Northcott that the meeting be opened to members of the public at 7.50pm.
Motion Carried (7/0)

3.2 - RFQ/34/22 - TREE MAINTENANCE SERVICE

WARD : ALL
: M/606/22
DATE : 9 November 2022
REF : DF
RESPONSIBLE : Executive Director
MANAGER : Technical Services

In Brief:

- The City issued a Request for Quotation (RFQ/34/22) for Tree Maintenance Services through the WALGA Preferred Contractor Panel PS010-008 and in accordance with Council Policy ADM 19 – Procurement of Goods or Services, the City evaluated submissions and this report provides background and recommendations.
- This report recommends that Council, in regard to RFQ/34/22 for Tree Maintenance adopt the recommendation detailed within Confidential Attachment 2 and accept the submission from Beaver Tree Services as the City's preferred Tenderer.

Tabled Items

Nil

Decision Type

- ☐ **Legislative** The decision relates to general local government legislative functions such as adopting/changing local laws, town planning schemes, rates exemptions, City policies and delegations etc.
- ☒ **Executive** The decision relates to the direction setting and oversight role of Council.
- ☐ **Quasi-judicial** The decision directly affects a person's rights or interests and requires Councillors at the time of making the decision to adhere to the principles of natural justice.

Officer Interest Declaration

Nil

Strategic Implications

Aspiration 2 – Environment

Objective 2.2 – Attractive, inclusive and functional public open spaces

2.2.1: Focus on achieving a high level of streetscape amenity in new developments

2.2.2: Improve the amenity of streetscapes in established suburbs to provide an attractive and shaded network that connects residents to locations of interest

Legal Implications

Assessment of legislation indicates that the following apply:

- Section 3.57 *Local Government Act 1995* – Tenders for providing goods or services
- Division 2 *Local Government (Functions and General) Regulations 1996* – Tenders for providing goods or services

Council Policy/Local Law Implications

Assessment of Policy/Local Law indicates that the following are applicable:

- Council Policy ADM 19 – Procurement of Goods or Services
- Council Policy ENG 6 - Street Tree Management

Budget/Financial Implications

The proposed expenditure can be accommodated in the FY 2022/2023 Budget, but will require an adjustment to the and Long Term Financial Plan estimates.

Consultation

1. Intra Directorate

BACKGROUND

The City of Armadale has an ongoing requirement for tree maintenance services, tree removals and scheduled under wire pruning as described. This is a specialised operation for which the City does not have the capacity and capability to effectively undertake the amount of maintenance required.

The City's previous contract for the same scope of works is expired. The City went to the market to ensure that it was well positioned to receive the best service-best cost outcome for the City and the community it serves. The incumbent, Beavers Tree Services were the only response to the call for tender.

Background of the Tender:

The City of Armadale (Principal) sought suitably experienced, qualified, and resourced Contractor/s to provide a high standard of scheduled and non-scheduled tree services throughout the City.

The City currently maintains a diverse range of over 27,000 street trees, and an estimated 30,000+ park trees as well as trees in natural areas, all of which have different characteristics, sizes, ages, health and condition.

All of the City's trees, located under power lines are pruned to meet legislated clearance, which is completed once annually or more regularly if required.

The service objectives under this contract are to manage all City Trees in accordance with the City's policy ENG 6 – Street Trees and the City's Urban Forest Strategy.

The range of services required under this contract to manage the City's trees are detailed in Table 1.

Table.1 Services undertaken under the Tree Management Contract

Services Undertaken	Brief Description
Clearance Pruning	Power-line proximity pruning
Remedial Pruning	Reactive pruning for non-power-line proximity pruning
Unspecified Pruning	Supply of machinery, week end rates, industrial areas
Tree Removal and Stump Grinding	Removal of tree and stumps
Stump Grinding	Stump grind not associated with tree removal
Palm Frond and Fruit Removal	Specific to palms only
Supply and Installation of Root Barrier	Root barrier installation to protect assets
Emergency call out/clean up works	Call outs and after hours
On site/offsite mulching including all equipment	Mulch all City vegetative waste generated by City works
Collection of waste generated by City works	Additional Plant Hire Specialised equipment
Additional Plant Hire	Specialised equipment
Environmental Works	Habitat cuts for works in environmental areas

The current contract seeks to secure Beaver's services, with an approximate annual contract value of \$1.8M for an initial period of three years with the potential for two extension periods of twelve months each (total contracted period of up to 5 years).

Analysis

From a budget line perspective, tree services expenditure is typically drawn down from the following projects:

- Tree Programme
- Active Open Space
- Passive Open Space
- Projects across the 'Old Armadale' areas.

As at the end of January 2023 Service Delivery has already procured \$800,000 of services from Beavers. This includes both reactive works and programmed works including the under power line pruning that is a regulatory requirement of the City. On this basis, although the estimated contract value is \$1.8m, given the current expenditure run-rate, it is likely that for

the remainder of the financial year, the end of financial year expenditure is likely to be in the vicinity of \$1.6M.

Budget analysis confirms the availability of funds for the remainder of FY23.

The FY24 budget will need to ensure that the estimated contract value of \$1,800,000 is accommodated in line with the delivery of the scope of services required throughout the street tree and any other associated budgets.

DETAILS OF PROPOSAL

Council approval is sought to:

Award for RFQ/34/22: Tree Maintenance Services for a period of three (3) years commencing December 2022 with an option to be extended for a further two (2) periods of twelve (12) months up to December 2027.

COMMENT

The RFQ was sent to six WALGA Preferred Contractors but only one submission, which is compliant, was received.

To gain an understanding of why submissions were not received from the five contractors the documents were issued to, feedback was sought. In summary the reasons for the contractors not responding were a combination of; insufficient capacity, proximity to the City, concern over the ability to achieve the necessary levels of service due to stretched resources.

Analysis

RFQ/34/22 – Tree Maintenance Services was closed at 2:00 pm on 09/09/2022. Submissions were received are summarised in Table 2.

Note, the service levels in the intervening period has been managed through discrete minor contracts while the most-effective means of delivery has been developed, reviewed and now presented to Council.

Table 2. Respondents

	Respondent's Name
1.	Beaver Tree Services

No Tenders were received after the close of deadline.

An evaluation of the one submission was undertaken having specific regard to the Qualitative Criteria (below), noting that the evaluation was based on value for money with price as a consideration.

A value for money basis means that the City considers the most advantageous combination of cost, quality, efficiency and sustainability (see Table 3), and therefore, the lowest price is not necessarily the most advantageous in meeting the City's requirements.

Table 3. Qualitative Criteria

Criteria	Weighting
Relevant Experience	40%
Key Personnel skills and Resources	25%
Methodology	25%
Sustainable Impacts	10%

Upon completion of the evaluation, scores and pricing were entered into the Evaluation Matrix as shown in the Confidential Attachment, where a final analysis took place to determine the suitability of the Tenderer.

CONCLUSION

Submissions for RFQ/34/22: Tree Maintenance Services were invited with one submission being received and assessed by an evaluation panel against compliance and qualitative criteria.

Irrespective of the low number of respondents, the City is keen to understand the Perth market's pressures and consequential price increases, as such the assessment team carried out analysis against the current arrangements for the delivery of services. As compared to the 2021 rates, the total estimated price represents an increase of 8.47%, the comparative CPI in WA to August 2022 is 6.8%. The assessment team considers the main contributors to the prices to be a combination of fuel increases, wage rises, the increased cost of tree maintenance equipment and a change in scope in that traffic management, for certain activities, is now built into the rates.

The full recommendation is contained within the confidential evaluation report provided in Confidential Attachment 2.

ATTACHMENTS

1. Schedule of Rates RFQ/34/22 Confidential Attachment 1 - *This matter is considered to be confidential under Section 5.23(2) (e ii) of the Local Government Act, as the matter, if disclosed, would reveal information that has a commercial value to a person*
2. Confidential Attachment 2 - Evaluation Report RFQ/34/22 - *This matter is considered to be confidential under Section 5.23(2) (e ii) of the Local Government Act, as the matter, if disclosed, would reveal information that has a commercial value to a person*

RECOMMEND

T4/5/23

That Council, in regard to RFQ/34/22: Tree Maintenance Services:

1. **Note the FY23 budget has the remaining capacity to fund the essential works that form the contract and its deliverables.**
2. **Note the need and the intention to review FY24 budget to ensure that there is provision for the full anticipated contract amount.**
3. **On the basis of the above, approve the award of the Tree Services contract to Beavers Tree Services.**

Moved Cr R Butterfield
MOTION CARRIED

(7/0)

4.1 - STOP SIGNS - CORNER OF WOLLASTON AVENUE, HAYNES AND ELEVENTH ROAD, HILBERT (COUNCILLOR REFERRAL ITEM)

At the Council meeting held on 30th January 2023, Cr J.Keogh referred the following matter to Technical Services Committee.

That the matter of installing stop signs at the corner of Wollaston Avenue and Eleventh Roads be referred to the Technical Services Committee.

Comment from Cr J.Keogh

Wollaston Road is about 60-70kms and many travel faster than this. The perpendicular road – Eleventh Road is 60kms and many also travel faster than this. The roads are long and straight and I have had at least 3 residents complain to me over the last year of ‘near misses’. There is no stop sign, give way sign or white line/s across the road to indicate where to stop/slow down. This area is going to increase in road traffic as time goes on and residents have requested to have lines painted and a sign to ensure drivers at least slow down, or perhaps even have a stop sign installed.

Referral items normally require a decision of Council before any resources are allocated, but given this is a potential road safety issue, it has been investigated and a recommendation made.

Officer Comment

Wollaston Avenue and Eleventh Road are currently both speed zoned at 70km/h. Officers from Main Roads Western Australia (MRWA) and the City had a site meeting on 22 February 2023 to investigate the matter. MRWA guidelines state the following for STOP control consideration:

STOP control shall only be applied where sight distances are limited from the minor road. Crash history and/or traffic calming are not warrants for STOP control. These require resolution by other means. ASI742.2 2009 clause 2.5.4 sets out the requirements for STOP control. Inappropriate use of STOP signs leads to their disregard.

Officers at the site meeting assessed the sight distance requirements at the intersection, and confirmed that sight distance is sufficient in both directions along Wollaston Avenue. Therefore, based on the points detailed above, the STOP control is not warranted.

However, it was agreed that a GIVE WAY sign and line marking should be installed on Eleventh Road at the intersection. To further improve road safety at the intersection, it was also recommended to install barrier lines with raised reflective pavement markers (RRPMs) on the approaches to the intersection, and in addition, provide street lighting at the intersection.

The Design team will arrange sign and pavement marking drawing's on the above to MRWA for approval and installation. Costings for sign and line marking is incorporated into this financial year Budget and installation will be completed once approval has been received

from MRWA. Currently there is no remaining Budget for the installation of Street Lighting in this financial year, however the design and installation will be accommodated in the budget for FY24, to further improve safety at this location.

ATTACHMENTS

There are no attachments for this report.

Committee Discussion

It was queried if there have been any crashes at this location. Councillors will be provided with any relevant information.

RECOMMEND

T5/5/23

That Council:

1. **Note the STOP control is not warranted.**
2. **Note the Design team will arrange a sign and pavement marking drawing to MRWA for approval and installation of a GIVE WAY sign, line marking, and barrier lines with RRPMs.**
3. **Note the Design team will arrange the installation of street lighting at the intersection that complies with AS1158 standards.**

Moved Cr M S Northcott
MOTION CARRIED

(7/0)

4.2 - WASTE STRATEGY AND FOGO

At the Council meeting held on 27 March 2023, Cr Scott Mosey referred the following matter to Technical Services Committee.

That the matter of Waste Strategy and FOGO be referred to the Technical Services Committee

Comment from Cr Scott Mosey

I would like to understand where we are at with the City's Waste Strategy generally, but in particular with the plan to implement FOGO.

Officer Comment

City Officers have completed the CEO KPI – Review the City's Strategic Waste Management Plan (SWMP) by June 2023.

A presentation on the Review of City's Waste and Resource Recovery Strategy will be provided following the Technical Services Committee Meeting on 1 May 2023 which includes the Councillor's referral item.

Suggested recommendation

Note the information provided and suggested attendance on 1 May 2023.

ATTACHMENTS

There are no attachments for this report.

RECOMMEND

T6/5/23

That Council:

- 1. Note the information presented in the Review of the City's Waste and Resource Recovery Strategy*

Moved Cr S Peter

MOTION CARRIED

(7/0)

COUNCILLORS' ITEMS

Nil

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TECHNICAL SERVICES REPORT

Nil

MEETING DECLARED CLOSED AT 8.16pm