

SPECIAL MEETING OF COUNCIL
16 April 2003

MINUTES

OF SPECIAL MEETING OF THE ARMADALE CITY COUNCIL HELD IN THE COUNCIL CHAMBERS, 7 ORCHARD AVENUE, ARMADALE ON WEDNESDAY, 16 APRIL 2003 COMMENCING AT 7.30 PM

1 DECLARATION OF OPENING / ANNOUNCEMENT OF VISITORS

Mayor, Cr Reynolds, declared the meeting open at 7.30 pm.

**2 RECORD OF ATTENDANCE / APOLOGIES / LEAVE OF ABSENCE
(previously approved)**

PRESENT:

| | |
|---|--------------------------|
| Mayor, Cr L Reynolds JP presided over: | Westfield Ward |
| Deputy Mayor, C J H Munn JP CMC | West Armadale Ward |
| Cr J Knezevich | West Armadale Ward |
| Cr F R Green | Armadale Ward |
| Cr R R Fletcher | Armadale Ward |
| Cr G M Hodges | Forrest Ward |
| Cr H A Zelones JP | Kelmscott Ward |
| Cr V L Clowes-Hollins | Kelmscott Ward |
| Cr J Everts | Seville Ward |
| Cr R C Stubbs AM | Roleystone Ward |
| Cr D L Hopper JP | Roleystone Ward [7.32pm] |

IN ATTENDANCE:

| | |
|----------------|---|
| Mr R S Tame | Chief Executive Officer |
| Mr W A Bruce | Executive Director Technical Services |
| Mr A F Maxwell | Executive Director Corporate Services |
| Mr I MacRae | Executive Director Development Services |
| Mr C Askew | Director Community Services |
| Mr N Cain | Executive Manager Business Services |

Public: Nil
Press: Nil

LEAVE OF ABSENCE:

Nil

APOLOGIES:

Apologies received from Crs Stewart, Cominelli & Cumming

MOVED Cr Munn that the apologies be received.

110/4/2003 MOTION not opposed, DECLARED CARRIED (11-0)

3 PUBLIC QUESTION TIME

Nil

4 BUSINESS BEFORE COUNCIL

**TONKIN HIGHWAY EXTENSION – MILLS STREET WEST (MARTIN)
TO THOMAS ROAD**

To urgently consider the matter of possible exclusions and shortfall in the proposed MRWA Contract for extension of the Tonkin Highway to Thomas Road, Byford.

MOVED Cr Reynolds that Standing Orders be suspended to allow open discussion on the matter.

111/4/2003 MOTION not opposed, DECLARED CARRIED (11-0)

TONKIN HIGHWAY EXTENSION MILLS STREET WEST (MARTIN) TO THOMAS ROAD (BYFORD)

WARD All
FILE REF: ENG/27
DATE 3 April 03
REF EDTS
RESPONSIBLE EDTS
MANAGER

In Brief:

- Discusses the impact of the project exclusions from the prime Tonkin Highway Extension Contract on the City.

Recommend

- That Council expresses its extreme disquiet that the full value to its community of the State Government's investment in the Tonkin Highway extension will not be realised due to the exclusions from the Contract which greatly reduce the project's efficiency in the area of:
 - community connectivity;
 - road user safety;
 - community amenity;
 - Metropolitan development growth equity
- That Council advise the Hon. Minister for Planning and Infrastructure and the Commissioner of Main Roads Western Australia of the Council's priorities for works to be added.

Tabled Items

Nil.

Officer Interest Declaration

Nil.

Strategic Implications

Physical Infrastructure

Develop an integrated transport system including safety aspects.

Legislation Implications

Full assessment of all relevant legislation indicates no restriction.

Council Policy/Local Law Implications

General assessment has not revealed any applicable Policies/Local Laws.

Budget/Financial Implications

Nil.

Consultation

Main Roads WA

BACKGROUND

The Cities of Armadale and Gosnells and the Shire of Serpentine-Jarrahdale established a Pre-Construction Activities Working Group of senior technical officers to work with Main Roads Western Australia (MRWA) to ensure that the planning and project management work on the Tonkin Highway Extension Project was progressed speedily and effectively. Since the early 1990's, the City has repeatedly presented (to the State Government) the benefits of the Tonkin Highway project to the regional (and State) community. These benefits justified the State Government's commitment and investment in the project.

During the course of project planning, the City's representatives have highlighted those aspects that maximise the projects community benefit. These included the highway's relationship to adjoining Brookdale and Westfield communities, intersections with Armadale Road, Ranford Road and Forrest Road, the Corfield Street – Seaforth Avenue link, Champion Drive – Garden Street link, Lake Road rail-crossing, Champion Lakes project, and other matters.

In July 2002 MRWA advised that Seaforth Avenue and Corfield Street would be constructed to intersect the Tonkin Highway, provided the two Cities (Gosnells & Armadale) agreed to the closure of Seaforth Avenue, enabling shortening of bridge works.

However, the tendering process for the Design and Construct Contract failed to deliver a number of key opportunities as the contract price is substantially in excess of rates for the Kwinana Freeway and Roe Highway extension contracts. On 6th February 2003, MRWA wrote to the City indicating that a number of significant components of the Project had been excluded from the prime contract see Attachment "A-2" as circulated with the Agenda. This led to a meeting with the Minister for Planning & Infrastructure and Member for Armadale, the Hon Alannah MacTiernan, attended by the Mayor, Chair of Technical Services, CEO and Executive Director Technical Services. The Commissioner for Main Roads and MRWA officers also attended. The meeting confirmed the project's financial constraints. Subsequent advice received from the Minister for Planning and Infrastructure on the 8th April 2003 stated that the Principal Shared Path, between Corfield Street and Armadale Road, would now be included as part of the "package of priced options" for the Project see Attachment "A-2" as circulated with the Agenda.

The exclusions have substantial adverse impacts on one or more of:

- community connectivity
- road user safety,
- community amenity
- Metropolitan Growth equity.

At its meeting of 25th February 2003 the City of Gosnells passed the following recommendation *see Attachment "A-2"*:

"That Council adopt the position that the construction of the Corfield Street extension is a high priority and reiterate to the Minister for Planning and Infrastructure the previous

commitment, in writing from the Commissioner of Main Roads Western Australia, to fund the cost of the Corfield Street construction as part of the closure of Seaforth Avenue and development of the Corfield Street / Tonkin Highway interchange and urge the Minister to identify necessary sources of funding and that this Council asks the CEO to contact the CEO of the City of Armadale with a view of making a joint approach to the Minister for Planning and Infrastructure and all local politicians regarding the concerns of both municipalities.”

As a result a meeting was held between the Mayors, CEOs and senior technical officers of the Cities of Armadale and Gosnells. The meeting decided that a mutually supportive approach to the appropriate State Government Ministers and Agencies on the exclusions be developed. (The City does not agree that “construction of the Corfield Street extension from Eileen Street to Lake Road remains a local government responsibility”. The State Government wishes to close the Lake Road rail crossing. The Tonkin Highway project is required to link to the local road network to provide community benefit. These are clearly project responsibilities).

COMMENT

1. Community Connectivity

Shortening the bridge over Albany Highway and South West Railway by closing Seaforth Ave and realigning Seaforth Ave and Corfield St to intersect with the Tonkin Highway was identified as a significant saving. MRWA agreed, in their letter of 12 July 2002, (*see Attachment “A-2”*) to assist with funding for the construction of the Corfield Street extension in the City of Gosnells and the realignment of Seaforth Avenue in the City of Armadale, provided the two Cities agreed with closure of Seaforth Avenue at the Tonkin Highway bridge. However, apparently as a consequence of the incapacity of MRWA’s design and construct tendering process to deliver the actual savings of the bridge-shortening facilitated by the closure of Seaforth Avenue, this agreement is being repudiated by MRWA. Indeed, the tendering process has failed to deliver a competitive price for the entire project.

The consequence of this repudiation is that, if MRWA does not fund the realignments, the bridge will have to be built on the longer arrangement with Seaforth Avenue maintained on its current alignment. Consequently, Blackspot intersections at Albany Highway / Lake Road and Lake Road / Seaforth Ave and a Blackspot railway crossing at Lake Road will all be retained. Further, grade separation structures and earthworks will be constructed now, but not used for some time, if ever; or - even worse – a substantial project to rework the eventual Corfield Street/ Seaforth Avenue/ Tonkin Highway intersection will have to be undertaken in the future, once the Project is opened, at greater expense to the community than if the work was completed now.

The deviation of Seaforth Avenue onto Westrail land to accommodate the bridge construction works is totally unacceptable to the City of Armadale for any period beyond the construction phase. It also leaves the Cities of Armadale and Gosnells with a costly project to connect its communities to the Tonkin Highway. Hence the use of this very sub-standard alignment to garner savings to the Project, while leaving the expense of re-establishing community connectivity to the Cities of Armadale and Gosnells, is not acceptable.

It must also be stated that any disruption to the existing community connectivity is always required to be reinstated as part of the Project costs. This position is not being honoured by requiring the Cities of Armadale and Gosnells to fund the roadworks required to maintain community connectivity between Kelmscott and Gosnells on the western side of the Railway. To ensure that the Project is completed satisfactorily, the Cities of Armadale and Gosnells require MRWA to honour its original commitment to fully fund the works to connect Corfield Street and Seaforth Avenue to the Tonkin Highway, in the configuration agreed by both Councils.

2. Road User Safety

The dualling of Armadale Road, between the existing dual carriageway just east of the Wungong Brook bridge and the Tonkin Highway intersection, was always considered by Council to be an essential component of the project. As the Southern Link Road has yet to be determined, the Albany and South Western Highways remain significant arterial freight routes. Consequently, heavy freight will be using Armadale Road as the principal access route to the Tonkin Highway. The use of the single carriageway configuration for an indeterminate period is totally unacceptable for road user safety reasons. The crash statistics for Armadale Road between Wungong Bridge and Forrest Road are 85 accidents over 5 years. On the 15th March 2003, a fatal crash involving a freight vehicle occurred, greatly reinforcing Council's anxiety about the long-term continuation of the single carriageway. It is also the City of Armadale's considered view that the crash record of the road could attract Blackspot funding of approximately \$4m on two sections over two years from Federal and State Blackspot Funding.

It is unlikely that Council will remove the current permit for heavy freight to use Albany Highway between the Tonkin Highway and Armadale Road, passing through Kelmscott town site, or will permit heavy freight vehicles to use Armadale Road between the Tonkin Highway and the existing dual carriageway to the east. It is apparent that such an outcome would have a significant negative medium-term impact on the actual network benefit delivered by the Extension, relative to its potential network benefit, so rendering the Project sub-optimal until the dualling is completed.

Whilst it is acknowledged that during concept planning for the Tonkin Highway / Armadale Road MRWA proposed an at grade intersection, that planning also included a grade separation at Forrest Road to maintain community connectivity. During the pre-construction phase, the crossing of the Tonkin Highway at Forrest Road was removed at Council's initiative and the funds saved reallocated to the grade separation

of the Tonkin Highway / Armadale Road intersection. It is noted with great anxiety that the reversion to an at grade intersection will immediately produce an intersection in the worst top 40 – 60 intersections in the Perth Metropolitan Area (ranked by crash costs). Again, there would appear to be some proactive opportunity to access Blackspot funding to upgrade the intersection to prevent this outcome.

3. Community Amenity

The proposed surface treatment and noise walls deliver only the minimum standard of noise abatement throughout an area that is planned for a substantial, high quality, land development. Indeed, one of the principal social benefits to be produced by the extension is the impetus to expand the supply of quality developable land in the South East Metropolitan Corridor. The noise management proposed for the Project singularly fails to accomplish this outcome and does not deliver outcomes considered standard to other metropolitan communities.

4. Metropolitan Growth Equity

The standard of quality of the Tonkin Highway extension is more at the level of a rural road, rather than that of a major urban transport artery. This is in strong contradiction to the transport corridors in the North West and South West Corridors. Consequently, the quality of development on the Western and Eastern corridors of the Metropolitan Area is seriously biased against the inland Corridors. There is already a serious imbalance in development along the coast compared to the scarp and construction of a “substandard” highway only compounds this inequity.

CONCLUSION

It seems to be a significant social, environmental and economic tragedy to construct a \$150m project which, for a handful of percentage points of extra expenditure, would deliver a major impetus to the overall development of the transport network and the balanced development of the Metropolitan Area.

Finally, Council is most concerned and aggrieved that the outsourcing and tendering process so vigorously pursued by State Governments over recent years, has come to an end point which delivers a reduced standard project at a premium price. This failure represents yet another disadvantage to the communities of the South East Metropolitan Corridor, and in particular to those of the Cities of Armadale and Gosnells, and the Shire of Serpentine Jarrahdale.

Cr Munn joined the meeting at 7.07pm

The Executive Director Technical Services briefed Committee on the fundamental aspects of the Tonkin Highway project as detailed in the report.

Committee expressed grave concerns with the proposed exclusions to the original Tonkin Highway Extension Contract. It was suggested that Council urgently revisit the history of the Tonkin Highway Extension Campaign and that the two Cities (Armadale and Gosnells) urgently take a united approach to the Minister and MRWA regarding the inequities of a project that is considered crucial for development of the south east corridor.

Committee noted the Minister's letter of 4th April 2003 attached to this agenda confirming the funding for the principal shared path between Corfield Street and Armadale Road.

To enable urgent attention to the course of action proposed it was requested that the Mayor call a special meeting of Council on Wednesday 16 April 2003 at 7.30pm.

Cr Stubbs left the meeting between 7.40pm and 7.42pm

CS16/4/03 RECOMMEND

1. **That Council expresses its extreme concern that the full value to its community of the State Government's investment in the Tonkin Highway extension will not be realised, due to the exclusions from the Prime Contract which greatly reduce the project's efficiency and effectiveness in the areas of:**

- **community connectivity;**
- **road user safety;**
- **community amenity;**
- **Metropolitan development growth equity**

to the Hon. Minister for Planning and Infrastructure, the Hon. Minister for Road Safety, the Members for Armadale and Southern River, the Director General of the Department for Planning and Infrastructure, the Commissioner of Main Roads Western Australia, the Commissioner of Police and the Chairman of the Road Safety Council.

2. **That Council advise the Hon. Minister for Planning and Infrastructure and the Commissioner of Main Roads Western Australia that the Council's priorities for works to be added to the Contract are:**
 - i) **the inclusion of the Corfield Street / Seaforth Avenue constructions to intersect the Tonkin Highway as planned and funded by Main Roads Western Australia as advised in their correspondence dated 12 July 2002.**
 - ii) **the dualling of Armadale Road between Forrest Road and Wungong Brook be undertaken as a fundamental component**

of the Project to remove a serious Blackspot with full funding from either the Federal or State Blackspot Programme.

- iii) the grade separation of Armadale Road / Tonkin Highway be undertaken using Blackspot funding in order to avoid the immediate creation of a high-ranking Metropolitan Blackspot.**
 - iv) the provision of noise management appurtenances and measures, including road surface and noise walls, which ensure urban development adjacent to the Tonkin Highway is not compromised compared to land adjacent to other main roads within the metropolitan area.**
- 3. That the Hon. Minister for Planning and Infrastructure be thanked for the provision of additional funds to provide the Principal Shared Path between Corfield Street and Armadale Road.**
 - 4. That the City of Gosnells be informed of the City of Armadale's position on the exclusions from the Tonkin Highway Extension Contract.**

Moved Cr Hopper
Motion Carried (7-0)

MOVED Cr Hopper that Standing Orders be resumed.

112/4/2003 MOTION not opposed, DECLARED CARRIED (11-0)

MOVED Cr Hopper that the second paragraph of CS16/4/03 be amended to read as follows:-

“to the Premier, Hon. Minister for Planning and Infrastructure, the Hon. Minister for Road Safety, the Leader of the Opposition, the Members for Armadale, Southern River and Roleystone, the Director General of the Department for Planning and Infrastructure, the Commissioner of Main Roads Western Australia, the Commissioner of Police and the Chairman of the Road Safety Council.”

113/4/2003 AMENDMENT not opposed, DECLARED CARRIED (11-0)

MOVED Cr Hopper that Recommendation CS16/4/03, as amended, be adopted.

114/4/2003 MOTION not opposed, DECLARED CARRIED (11-0)

5 CLOSURE

Mayor, Cr Reynolds, declared the meeting closed at 7.44 pm

MINUTES CONFIRMED THIS 28th DAY OF APRIL 2003

MAYOR