



**Annual General Meeting of Electors**  
**Wednesday 12 April 2023**

# **MINUTES**

**OF THE ANNUAL GENERAL MEETING OF ELECTORS HELD IN THE FUNCTION ROOM, ADMINISTRATION CENTRE, ORCHARD AVENUE, ARMADALE ON WEDNESDAY 12 APRIL 2023 COMMENCING AT 7PM**

**PRESENT:**

The Mayor, Cr R Butterfield Presided	River Ward
Deputy Mayor, Cr K Busby	Minnawarra Ward
Cr G J Smith	Minnawarra Ward
Cr J Keogh	River Ward
Cr K Kamdar	Ranford Ward
Cr S Peter JP	Ranford Ward
Cr S Virk	Lake Ward
Cr M Silver (7.08pm)	Lake Ward
Cr G Nixon	Hills Ward
Cr S J Mosey	Hills Ward
Cr P A Hetherington	Palomino Ward
Cr M S Northcott	Palomino Ward
Cr E Flynn	Heron Ward

**IN ATTENDANCE:**

Ms J Abbiss	Chief Executive Officer
Mr J Lyon	Executive Director Corporate Services
Mrs S Van Aswegen	Executive Director Community Services
Mr M Andrews	Executive Director Technical Services
Mr B Garvey	Coordinator City Governance
Mr D Baker	Senior Governance Officer
Mrs A Owen-Brown	Executive Assistant Corporate Services

Public: 20

**APOLOGIES:**

Cr M J Hancock	Heron Ward (Leave of absence)
----------------	-------------------------------

Her Worship the Mayor, Cr Ruth Butterfield, welcomed those in attendance to the 2021/22 Annual General Meeting of Electors and addressed the meeting as follows:

*Good evening everyone and welcome to the City of Armadale's Annual General Meeting of Electors of 2023, held on Wednesday the 12<sup>th</sup> of April*

*I will now go through the order or proceedings and just say welcome along everyone; ladies, gentlemen, Councillors, staff and welcome of course to your Annual General Meeting which I'll now declare open at one minute past 7pm.*

*Firstly, I would like to introduce you to your Councillors (members if I could ask you to stand, if able to stand, as I call your name and introduce you). To my right here I have Cr Kerry Busby Deputy Mayor and councillor for Minawarra Ward, we have Cr Gary Smith also of Minawarra Ward; we have Cr Keyur Kamdar of Ranford Ward; Cr Shanavas Peter of Ranford Ward; Cr Sam Virk for Lake Ward; Cr Scott Mosey of Hills Ward; Cr Grant Nixon, Hills Ward; Cr Paul Hetherington, Palomino Ward; and Cr Melissa Northcott also of Palomino Ward; Cr Emma Flynn from Heron Ward; Cr John Keogh my colleague in River Ward; and we have an apology from Cr Michelle Silver; and we have a leave of absence for Cr Michael Hancock who is overseas at the moment.*

*I'll also present are our Executive Team and the CEO so to my left here is Ms Joanne Abbiss, CEO of the City of Armadale, Mr Jason Lyon, Executive Director of Corporate Services over to my left also; Ms Suzette Van Aswegen, Executive Director of Community Services; and Mr Mike Andrews, Executive Director of Technical Services. Thank you for being here.*

*Usually we would conduct this meeting early in the financial year, however because of delays in receiving the City's audit report from the Office of the Auditor General, we were unable to do so until now*

*I will conduct this meeting generally in accordance with the Council's Standing Orders. There are copies of meeting rules and procedures available on the seats around you. Please take the time to familiarise yourself with these rules and procedures. Particularly if you want to get involved.*

*If there is a vote on anything, each elector is entitled to one vote.*

*Only electors of the City are entitled to a vote at this meeting, however should the meeting decide by resolution that residents of the district who are not on the electoral roll, but are eligible to become an elector, are permitted to vote.*

*Any motion passed by this meeting will be submitted to Council for consideration at the next Ordinary Council meeting or, if that is not practicable at the first Ordinary Council meeting after that meeting; or at a special meeting called for that purpose, whichever happens first.*

*Could all speakers please state their name and address before they speak.*

*I also wish to advise that tonight's proceedings are being recorded.*

<b>1 BUSINESS OF MEETING</b>
------------------------------

**Presenting the 2021/22 Annual Report**

The Presiding Member, Mayor Ruth Butterfield, read aloud the Mayor's Foreword (Page 1 of the Annual Report).

**1.1 2021/22 Annual Financial Report**

The Mayor called for questions to be raised that specifically related to the Annual Financial Report.

No questions were raised.

---

**1.2 Auditor's Report**

The Mayor called for questions to be raised that specifically related to the Auditor's Report (Page 46 of the Annual Report).

No questions were raised.

---

**1.3 2021/22 Annual Report (Remaining Parts)**

The Mayor called for questions to be raised specifically related to the remaining parts of the 2021/22 Annual Report.

No questions were raised.

---

---

## **2 GENERAL BUSINESS**

---

### **2.1 Questions of which prior notice has been given**

The Mayor referred to questions received from Mr D Healy on 11 April 2023 and advised the questions would be dealt with under Item 2.3.

---

### **2.2 Motions of which prior notice has been given**

Nil.

---

### **2.3 Questions received from the floor**

---

#### **Mr Douglas Healy – 11 William Street, Armadale**

---

*The Mayor read the submitted questions from Mr Healy and the officer responses as below.*

#### **EX ROMAN CATHOLIC CHURCH BUILDING SITUATED CORNER OF SOUTH-WEST HIGHWAY AND THOMAS STREET, ARMADALE**

Previous years minutes of the City of Armadale revealed that the Police Department was to pay \$600,000 to the City to go towards the restoration of the abovementioned church building.

#### **Q1a:**

Has this money been received by the City and where would it be recorded in financial reports?

#### **Response:**

The City has not received payment of the \$600k from Western Australian Police Force (WAPOL) to date, however payment is anticipated by the end of this financial year. The \$600k forms part of the total \$1.2M already allocated by Council to partially restore the building as per the current 22/23 Annual Budget (Refer to Page 78).

#### **Q1b:**

What is the City of Armadale doing about receiving this \$600,000?

#### **Response:**

The City is currently liaising with WAPOL to arrange payment. It should be noted that WAPOL has agreed and is required to make payment to the City as per their Development Approval for the Courthouse complex.

**Q1c:**

What is going to be the fate of this ex church building as it has been sitting idle for several years now?

**Response:**

A Crown Reserve for Community Purposes will be created to accommodate the St. Francis Xavier Church, including a Management Order providing the City with power to lease. A total of \$1.2M has been allocated to make the building safe as per the 22/23 Annual Budget. For clarity, the works recently delivered and that to be delivered this financial year includes fence installation, graffiti removal and the provision of utility services. Subsequently, the 'make safe' will include roof replacement (including timbers as needed), internal demolition, removal of hazardous materials, and the removal of vegetation immediately adjacent to foundations.

The building's future use will be subject to separate report to Council and business case to determine additional investment required to refurbish the building to a standard that it is fit for the preferred purpose and suitable for lease.

**FINANCIAL REPORT**

**Note 2 states Revenue from Fines as \$159,482.00.**

**Q2a:**

Does this also include revenue from infringement notices?

**Response:**

Revenue does include infringement notices.

**Q2b:**

What was the total revenue from infringement notices paid?

**Response:**

Value \$164,551.15.

Paid Infringements 1/7/2021 – 30/6/2022 =	1077	Value \$164,551
---	------	-----------------

Paid Infringements 1/7/2020 – 30/6/2021 =	608	Value \$119,554
---	-----	-----------------

Please note that paid infringements includes infringements that may have been issued in previous financial years and includes the additional costs added where infringements have been referred through to the Fines Enforcement Registry (FER).

**Q2c:**

How many infringement notices were issued?

**Response:**

1291 infringements were issued.

Issued Infringements 1/7/2021 – 30/6/2022 = 1291                      Penalty Value = \$86,272

Issued Infringements 1/7/2020 – 30/6/2021 = 787                      Penalty Value = \$68,889

**Note 2B state write off of infringement notices as \$34,401 well over the previous year's report and budget amount of \$26,800.**

**Q3a:**

What was the reason for this increase in the amount of revenue written off?

**Response:**

Increase in writes offs is attributable to the increase in the number of infringements issued, i.e. 197 infringements being written off as opposed to 63 Infringements on which the original budget was based.

Written Off Infringements 1/7/2021 – 30/6/2022 = 197

Written Off Infringements 1/7/2020 – 30/6/2021 = 63

**Q3b:**

What are the types of offences being included in this write off amount?

**Response:**

Offences included in the write off amount include infringements issued under the:

- |                                |   |
|--------------------------------|---|
| ▪ Bush Fires Act               | ▪ Planning and Development Act  |
| ▪ Cat Act                      | ▪ Activities and Trading in Thoroughfares and Public Places Local Law |
| ▪ Dog Act                      | ▪ Environment, Animals and Nuisance Local Law                         |
| ▪ Environmental Protection Act | ▪ Health Local Law  |
| ▪ Food Act                     | ▪ Parking and Parking Facilities Local Law                            |
| ▪ Health Act                   |   |
| ▪ Litter Act                   |   |

**Q3c:**

How many infringement notices are involved in this write off?

**Response:**

197 infringements were written off (WO) in the write off figure.

---

**Mr Phil Davey – 12 Lenore Street, Roleystone**

---

Q1: At the last AGM when I raised the question in regards to staff turnover, it was indicated there was an average local government turnover of 22.9% and with the City of Armadale sitting at 20.1%.

Can you please update what turnover has occurred in the last 12 months and what percentage level City of Armadale are currently sitting at?

*CEO: I would like to provide the exact figures to Mr Davey but from memory, in the latest figures provided by WALGA the City is sitting just over the P50 percentile in terms of staff turnover, so we're sitting just over the average for all of local government. In terms of exact figures I would have to get back to you.*

---

**Ms Veronica Hansen – 8 Protector Grove, Roleystone**

---

Q1: Regarding last electors meeting Motions 2 and 4 that referred respectively to KPIs for the Councillors and the CEO. The City's response was that the Council's position on any further publication of performance information is subject to the Local Government Act reform proposals being progressed by the Department of Local Government.

Can you please advise have those reforms been completed and when will the City be adopting those changes?

*Mayor: I believe the first tranche of the reform Act has passed one level of parliament at the moment. The publishing of the CEO's KPIs are part of that first tranche of reforms. We are waiting for details and the City won't be doing anything until those reforms are gazetted.*

*CEO: Confirmed that information is correct.*

---

**Ms Meg Travers – 12 Croyden Road, Roleystone**

---

Q1: I would like to follow up one of the motions from the last AGM that there would be an online engagement portal provided by the City and I'm wondering how that's going as it has been some time ago.

*Mayor: Yes, there is an online engagement portal. It's up and running and the link is on our social pages and the website. We promote it in our social media quite regularly.*

*# Supplementary advice provided with the Minutes and not part of the meeting:*

The link can be found here: <https://engage.armadale.wa.gov.au/>

---

**Mr Ian Dunstan – U19/24 Aragon Court, Armadale**

---

Q1: My question is one that I asked last year regarding the \$250,000 allocated to consultancy landscaping underneath the viaduct. Whereabouts are we at as far as that goes? I've looked back through the Council Minutes and haven't seen anything at this stage as anything being done.

*Mayor: The landscaping consultants have come forward with some fabulous ideas as far as what could occur underneath the viaduct. We are using that information to negotiate with the State government and the Metronet team to actually establish some guidelines around what our expectations are. This information is not public but the City is using that information to negotiate the best outcomes for the Community and we will be publicly consulting; and I note that the Metronet team are consulting at the moment about all things 'elevated rail' and what we and the Community would like to see under the rail.*

*The consultants that we have engaged have given us ideas on how it should look and could look; and have encouraged us to go down that path. Now we need to hear back from the Community and will be putting both of those projects together, we will be determining what budget needs to be spent on it, whose budget it will be as we need to be mindful of the impact on the City's budget when we are gifted several hectares of extra public open space to manage. The City needs to be careful of what goes underneath and what infrastructure is put in, the types of treatments, eg. does the community want basketball courts or grass. All of the treatment options will cost different amounts of money to maintain and it will need to be determined who will maintain them.*

*All of the information will be considered in the decisions that are currently being negotiated.*

---

**Mr Phil Davey – 12 Lenore Street, Roleystone**

---

Q2: In addition to the staffing turnover question, temporary staffing costs – where are we at currently in a comparison between temporary staffing cost expenditures versus having full time employees, which I know we're having trouble getting?

*CEO: Within budget.*

Q3: In regards to agendas and minutes timelines, I've asked previously and would like to ask again for a change to the current timelines being used to make minutes available for a Council meeting. Committees are able to have their minutes of meetings out that same week, ready for the following Monday's Council meeting. The Council meeting agenda is mostly made up of those Committee minutes and items of referral and recommendation for Council discussion and decision.

Currently residents wait up to two weeks from each Council meeting for the respective minutes. I would again ask for a change in this practice so that residents and Councillors



can get these minutes a bit quicker, enabling more time for all parties to read and review prior to the next Council meeting. Current timing is limited from the minutes being allocated and received to the next meeting of discussion, normally only giving us the weekend at best to review.

*Mayor: I note this was discussed after last year's AGM and no doubt it will be discussed again. At the last AGM when it was discussed and investigated if it would be possible to get those agendas and minutes out in different timing, it was not able to be done with the current staff allocation.*

---

**Ms Bree Hartley – 6 Haimlee Street, Kelmscott**

---

Q1: I'm the president of the Roleystone Theatre and we are appreciative of the ongoing support and the work in progress of the Roleystone Theatre building. We are well past the expected completion date. We've had to move our first two shows out of the City of Armadale and need to know if we have to cancel another show.

We are wondering if there is an expected date for practical completion.

*CEO: I understand from the Executive Director Technical Services (EDTS) that there is a meeting to be held with yourself and the contractor in the coming weeks.*

*EDTS: The contractor, Swan Group and myself were hoping to meet with you (Ms Hartley) to give you a bit more understanding of the background of the delays and a way forward to try and give more confidence in the expected practical completion date and will make contact in the very near future.*

---

**Ms Veronica Hansen – 8 Protector Grove, Roleystone**

---

Q2: In relation to Motion 3 that was raised at the last meeting. That the City of Armadale provide better transparency with reports so that a full document is not classified as confidential by just one paragraph or notation that is considered confidential but the need for confidentiality and privacy is still addressed by appropriate processes or redacting or removing that information.

Is there another way that that information can be still kept confidential but that the information around the report at least is still put into the minutes, perhaps a summary with sufficient information so the public understand what's happening?

*Mayor: I understand what you're asking but I think we do that to the extent we are able to. We do the very best that we can to keep people informed. We are doing it in accordance with the Act and following the laws that we are held to account by and we're not always able to give a report. Tender report amounts will become public after the tender has been awarded and has become public; and we are as transparent as we can be. Before that, the commercial confidentiality must be in place.*

---

**Mr Douglas Healy – 11 William Street, Armadale**

---

Q1: In my questions before I asked the types of offences being written off in the infringement notices.

Is Council able to monitor the types of offences for any trends that may need further action to stop those offences from recurring?

*Mayor: Yes, our Rangers would have that information and yes we could keep an eye on trends. If our Rangers (or other staff issuing infringements) would be able to see spikes and will bring to our attention if necessary.*

---

**Mr Phil Davey – 12 Lenore Street, Roleystone**

---

Q4: In relation to the first Motion at last year's AGM that the City of Armadale engage in a more proactive system of communication with the community and community groups. The reply in the minutes referred to the Markyt Community Scorecard and the next survey was proposed to be undertaken at the end of 2022.

Do we have an update of that proposed survey and any results at this stage?

*Mayor: That survey has gone out. Results have not been communicated as yet, however a Councillor Workshop to review the results will be occurring in the coming weeks.*

---

**Mr Laurie Sargeson – 8 Imperial Court, Seville Grove**

---

Q1: A question of the Councillor competency training; some have done it, some have started and some haven't begun it. The website, a few days ago, shows it's not done (7 not done).

When will it be done? Are the Councillors still being paid for it and it's the CEO's responsibility?

*Mayor: I believe it's been completed. We have all completed it and are all compliant. The website needs updating.*

*# Supplementary advice provided with the Minutes and not part of the meeting:*

*The City's website currently has the report to 30 June 2022. The updated report will be available online after 30 June 2023 and this report will indicate that all Councillors have completed the mandatory training.*

---

**Mr Ian Dunston – U19/24 Aragon Court, Armadale**

---

Q2: In reference to the question I asked last year about the Sky/Treetop Walk. The CEO provided a response stating that the items are not included in the City View Concept in the Council's four year budget at this stage. Further work spoken about still needs to be done.

At the Ordinary Council Meeting of 26/04/2022, page 186 – Chief Executive Officer's Report, includes a timeframe of 2023-2028; City Views Skywalk \$16.5M, Landscaping and Public Realm.

Are you able to expand a little bit, predominantly on the Skywalk?

CEO: *I believe that the report you refer to was for the adoption of the City's Advocacy Priorities or Investment Framework. One of the many projects the City is trying to advocate for in terms of the City Centre is the redevelopment of this Civic Precinct. The Council has adopted that as a concept plan and there is a lot more work that needs to be done before that can be brought to fruition. It was important for Council to give the City, and the community, the indication that this is the broader vision for this precinct.*

*Part of the Advocacy Priorities for the City Centre was also a health and medical precinct. Following the adoption of that advocacy strategy, the City has been able to engage consultants to prepare a detailed business case for a regional health and medical precinct within the City Centre. The presentation of the first draft of this business case to the Executive was done this morning. The adoption of the Civic Precinct Plan hasn't had a business case done yet. But we have been engaging with the Department of Justice and the WA Police and also the Department of Training and Workforce Development because the City is incredibly keen, and ~~the~~ for the Civic Precinct to properly function, it relies on the City gaining the courthouse land. The Department of Justice may want to continue the use of the courthouse building.*

*The City owns land adjacent to the new TAFE. The understanding from the Department of Training and Workforce Development's planning, is that the new facility will be at capacity in two years and Stage 2 of their development plan is to expand on the City's land. What the City is trying to negotiate, and why it was important for Council to adopt the Civic Precinct Concept in the advocacy strategy, is a 'swap' in terms of the courthouse land for the City's freehold land next to the TAFE. Also, WA Police will be moving out of their facility and into the new courthouse and justice precinct. What the City is trying to negotiate is that the Department of Justice use the old police station for any planned usage for the existing courthouse. However WA Police may have to use the old police station to house the upcoming recruitment of new police officers. Having the Civic Precinct Concept adopted allows us to have those conversations.*

*As stated last year, there is no budget commitment in terms of the tree top walk but it is part of an overall concept that may be funded at some point in the future. The Investment Framework identifies periods over which planning and design will occur but there's no specific budget commitment at this time.*

---

**Ms Pat Hart – 160 Croyden Road, Roleystone**

---

Stmnt: As Chair of Armadale Gosnells Landcare and Chair of the City's Bushcare and Environment Working Group, I just wanted to say thank you to all Councillors and the staff for their great support that you've given us over the year and over the past years. It's a great relationship that's lasted with the bush environment group it's 22 years now and it's just great. And I just wanted to thank you so much for the support and it's certainly been reflected into the value that you see our bushland and our waterways. So thank you, on behalf of all the volunteers.

---

**2.4 Motions received from the floor**

---

**MOTION-1**

---

MOVED Mr Phil Davey, SECONDED Ms Veronica Hansen

**That the CoA put in place a procedure whereby they agree to expend or allocate any financial year budget surplus by the end of the following financial year.**

**MOTION CARRIED**

---

**MOTION-2**

---

MOVED Ms Veronica Hansen, SECONDED Ms Bree Hartley

**That the City agree to accept and implement the FOGO program within City wards for the coming financial year, enabling a reduction of the City's carbon footprint and working towards nett zero emissions by 2030. And that the City ensures a trackable report each quarter, if practicable, to the progress of the FOGO program.**

**MOTION CARRIED**

---

**MOTION-3**

---

MOVED Mr Phil Davey, SECONDED Ms Veronica Hansen

**That the City of Armadale budget each financial year allocate \$25,000 to each ward for those ward Councillors to receive applications from the not-for-profits for funding and that the CoA give ward Councillors the delegated authority to discuss with their ward co-Councillor for automatic agreement to the value of \$1,000. Amounts over \$1,000 would require further Council approval. Ward Councillors would then report all applications and fundings back to the Council through regular Council meetings.**

**MOTION CARRIED**

Mr Davey further stated:

*We would like to thank the Council and Councillors for their continued input and support throughout the past year, not only for attending the many meetings and workshops but for those also getting out to the community to generally hear the residents' voices and listen to our concerns. We look forward to working with the Council in the coming year and continuing to make the City of Armadale an even better place to live, so just thank you, appreciated.*

*The Mayor thanked her fellow Councillors and the electors for their attendance.*

MEETING DECLARED CLOSED AT 8.00PM